PAT December, 2014; 10 (2): 131-144; ISSN: 0794-5213

Online copy available at

www.patnsukjournal.net/currentissue

Assessment of the Performance and Barriers to Small-Scale Fish Marketing in Dutsin-Ma Local Government Area, Katsina State, Nigeria.

Tiri,G.D[1].,Oshoke J[2], Nabinta, T.R[1],. Olatinwo L.K[1]

[1]Department of Agricultural Economics and Extension,
Federal University,Dutsin-Ma,Katsina State,Nigeria
[2]Department of Fisheries and Aquacultural Technology,
Federal University,Dutsin-Ma,katisna State,Nigeria.
Corresponding author: gtiri@fudutsinma.edu.ng

Abstract
The importance of fishery products and its marketing has always been an important discourse among scholars due to its contribution to gross national product and per capital income of fishermen and marketers in nations with fishing capabilities. In Nigeria, however, given increasing demand for fish, there seems to be a potentially strong market for the product. The study seems to quantify the determinants of factors influencing the performance of small-scale fish marketing in Dutsinma local government of Katsina State. Kendalls coefficient of concordance was used to test the agreement between ranked constraints of small-scale fish marketing in relation to performance. A sample size of (50) Fish marketers were drawn by a simple random technique from a registered population of(102) for two months and a structured questionnaire was used to elicit their responses from the Market. Data was analysed using statistical packaged for social sciences (SPSS). Results of the analysis indicated that age of marketers ($p<0.01$), years of formal education ($p<0.01$), annual cost incurred ($p<0.01$), membership of cooperative society ($p<0.01$) initial capital invested ($p<0.01$ are the most influential determinants of small scale fish marketing. The Kendalls coefficient of concordance indicates that there is 78% agreement between the respondents in the ranking of constraints in relation to performance, poor access to credit facilities, poor market infrastructures and poor record keeping habit are the most important constraints faced by small fish marketers. Based on the results we recommend a flexible and favourable policy geared toward helping young entrepreneurs through improved market infrastructures.
Key words: Small-scale fish, fish marketing, Constraints, Fishing capabilities.

Introduction

Biswas (1989) stated that fish is making an important contribution to world protein supply. Fish makes vital contribution to the survival and health of a significant portion of the world's population. Fish is especially important in the developing world. In some of Asias poorest countries (Bangladash, Cambodia), people derived as much as 75% of their daily protein from fish. In West Africa fish accounts for 30% of animal protein intake and this number would be larger if the poor could afford to buy more. Often referred to as "rich food for poor people". Fish provides essential nourishment especially quality proteins and fats (Macronutrients) vitamins and minerals (Micronutrients) for those involved in fisheries, aquaculture and fish trade, fish is a

source of income which can be used to purchase other additional food items, fish supply in Africa have been declining for a number of reasons while the demand has increased due to the rise in population, decrease in livestock production due to desertification, diseases (Olaoye etal, 2007) and drought. Strategies to increase fish supply are being promoted globally.

Nigeria is blessed with vast expense of inland fresh waters, marine and brackish eco system which are very rich in aquatic life. Tall, (2004) observed that Nigeria's Fish production volume of 0.5million tones cannot meet the annual demand of 1.3 million tones. Average annual fish consumption in the country has therefore stagnated at 9.2kg per capita, which is quite below the average of 13kg per capita, a situation that resulted in huge supply and consumption gap. The inter Academy council has also reported that future projections indicate a wider supply demand gap (I A C, 2004). Over 90% of domestic fish supply in Nigeria comes from artisanal capture fisheries (Falodun, 2011). Food security does not just concern food production. Fish provide the main source of animal protein to about one billion people globally. Fisheries are an important part of food security, particularly for many poor people in developing countries. In coastal areas and around major river systems the dependence on fish is usually higher (FAO, 2005). The importance of small scale fisheries in particular for food security is emphasized by (FAO, 2003) 38 million people worldwide are employed in fisheries, 95% of whom are in developing countries. The income from employment or the financial revenues from the sale of fish provides cash which can then be used for purchase of other food stuffs.

The fisheries sub –sector in Nigeria account for about 40% of animal protein in the diet and it contribute to 4.47%of the Agricultural share of the Nation's GDP in 2003 (Ojo and Fagbenro, 2004). Recently Demand for fish product has doubled as other sources of animal protein have become expensive due to pressure by the ever – increasing population and the high population costof the other animal protein source. (Ojo and Fagbenro, 2004). Domestic fish demand in 1998 was1.52 million tones while the domestic production was 292,800 tonnes (sufficiency ratio of 19.26%)(Ojo and Fagbenro, 2004)

In marketing, fish passes through various market participant and exchange point before they reach the final consumer. These markets intermediaries are the wholesale and retail .Both play important role in marketing of system, at all stages in the marketing channel ,fish has to be packed or un-packed to meet consumer 's demand .The artisanal fishing techniques used in Nigeria which include preparation by smoke drying, salting and sun drying do not give a guarantee to products of the quality required for international market infrastructural problems particularly transportation do militate against the development of fish marketing in Nigeria. Most fishermen will musts likely be limited to subsistence catch and much localized marketing opportunities

due to current constraints of transportation and lack of access to adequate processing facilities. Marketing is of high importance to fish, thus before we think of production, we must first of all think of an available market for fish. (Kohls & Uhl, 1980). They further stated that, the difficulty with the global food situation appears to be not how big a pie we can bake but how to cut and share the pieces. Agricultural production and fish marketing must develop hand in hand because they are partners in a progressive system. An efficient market is bound to foster the goals of economic development, namely increased real income and income redistribution. It is against this background that the present study attempts to quantify the factors influencing performance of retail fish marketing in Dutsin-ma Local Government Area and also identify potential constraints associated with fish marketing enterprise in Dutsin-ma, Katsina State.

Materials and Methods

Study area and data collection

The study was conducted in Dutsin-ma Local Government, Katsina State. It is located on Latitude $12^{o}27'18"$N and longitude $7^{o}29'29"$E and has its headquarters in the town of Dutsin-ma. It has an estimated area of $527km^2$ (203sqkm) and a population of 169,671 as at 2006 census. The popular Zobe dam is in the southern part of the local government Dauda *et al*., (2013). The population and activities in the local government area have increased in the last 3 years which may be due to the establishment of the new Federal University, Dutsin-ma. The Local Government has eleven (11) wards namely Bagadadi, Shema, Makera, Karawa, Kutawa, Kuki 1 and 2, Karofi 1 and 2 and Dutsin-ma 1 and 2. Artisanal fishing has become a common activity in the local government due to the presence of the Zobe dam, making fish marketing a common business and economic activity especially for communities around the Zobe dam. The Makera fish market is located five (5) km, southern part of the local government headquarters in a village called Daba Uban Lawai. This market is probably a daily market as all categories of fish marketers are found there selling different volume of fish either as fresh or smoked fishes. The fishes are pronominally fresh water fishes. The study was conducted between May and August, 2014. The basic information for the analysis was obtained from primary data collected with the aid of a structured questionnaire. A total of 50 fish marketers were systematically selected and interviewed. The selection of the marketers followed a simple random sampling technique.

Method of Data Collection

A total of fifty (50) fish marketers were random selected from a list of one hundred and two (102) registered marketers and through a well structured questionnaire, informal interviews with the marketers. Data was collected on their socio-economic

characteristics, marketing services and growth barriers and constraints faced by the marketers.

Method of analysis

Empirical model

The performance of fish marketing is affected by a number of socio-economic and institutional factors. The empirical model for quantifying the determinants of fish marketing is specified as:

Yi = βo x β1Ag x β2 Gend + β3 Mast x β4Edul x β5bExp x β6 Ownsta x β7Inticap x β9 Anualcos x β10 Memco x Ui…….(1)

Y = Performance (Measured Proxy as Profitability (NI = TR - TC).

Where profit (Used as proxy for performance) The proxy measurement of performance is consistent with the measurement on the study by Aworemi, Abdul-azeez & Opoola (2010), Edward M. etal, (2013, Ag is age of the marketer, mast is marital status of the marketer, Edu is number of formal years of education of the trader Expries the years of experience, Ownsta is the ownership status, Imacp is the initial capital, Annual cos is the annual cost incurred by the business, Memco is the membership of cooperative if any while Ui is the (bo) is the base constant or B1 – B10 are the regression Co-efficient, Ui is the stochastic error term. The explanatory variables definition and measurement insed in the empirical model are presented in table2 .

The Ordinary least square (OLs) estimation method is employed to determine the regression co-efficient due to the effect of the continuous variables on the dependent variable.

Results and Discussion

Socio-economic characteristics of the respondents.

Most of the respondents(60%) are within the active age of 35-54years,and have acquired between arabic and primary school education(52%).Majority (64%) have household size of 6-15 members and 6-15years of marketing experience,44% and 30% dried and smoked fish and fresh and dried fish respectively.Most(70%) of the marketers source their fish directly from artisanal local fishermen and 26% buy directly from local fishermen in zobe dam.The average distance between their homes and the market is between 1-10km(76%).Most of the traders (76%) earns an average income of between (N10,000-N20,000) per month.Most(70%) are married and 88% belong atleast one cooperative society.Many(60%) are primarily fish traders and 36% are artisanal fishermen.Majority(60%) started with an anitial capital of between(N1000—N20000) and employed between 1-4persons(94%) many(96%) and have an average weekly expenditure of (N1000—N10000).

Determinants of Performance of Fish Marketing

SPSS Version 16 was used to estimate the parameters and marginal effects of the determinants of the performance of fish marketing. The F – value is highly significant at 1% which indicates that the explanatory variables included in the regression model jointly influence the performance of retail fish marketing enterprises. The R-square value indicates that 82% of the variation in the performance of fish marketing business is explained by the independent variables (Table 2). The SPSS versions 16 software was used to estimate the parameters and marginal effects of the determinants of the performance of small scale enterprises. The F-value is highly significant at 1% which indicates that the explanatory variables included in the regression model jointly influence the performance of small scale enterprises. The R-squared value indicates that 82% of the variation in the performance of small scale business is explained by the independent variables.

The performance of small scale enterprise in Dutsin-ma is significantly determined by age of the entrepreneur, number of years of education, initial capital invested in the business and the annual cost incurred at the 1% significant level. Marital status of entrepreneur, number of years of experience in the business and the number of employees in the enterprise significantly affect small scale enterprise at the 5% level of significance. Statistically and numerically, the age of entrepreneur is the most influential determinant of performance of small scale enterprise.

The age of respondent is negatively associated with the performance of small scale enterprises in the study area. Older people engaged in small scale enterprises are less likely to increase their revenue though they may have enough experience in operating businesses. Aworemi et al, (2010) established a contrary view. They established a positive relationship between performance and age of respondents in their study on "Impact of Socio-economic Factors on the Performance of Small Scale Enterprises in Osun State, Nigeria". The present finding may be due to lack of innovativeness on the part of older people which is likely to impact negatively in their revenue level. Performance decrease by 18.8% for every additional year of age attained by any individual engaged in small scale business. Entrepreneurs that are married do not perform well in their enterprises. The result indicates that the performance of married entrepreneurs is lower than those that are not married by 61.9%. Low performance can be attributed to the high expenditure incurred by married entrepreneurs as they have to take care of the needs of their spouse. However, spouses can serve as a form of labour in increasing the revenue of the enterprise. The number of years of formal education attained by an entrepreneur is positively associated with the performance of small scale enterprise. The result is consistent with the findings by Aworemi et al, (2010). An additional year of education attained by a respondent will lead to increase in revenue by 11.7%.Education enables the individual to appreciate and adopt innovations as well

as make informed decision which is likely to impact positively on performance. The number of years of experience influences the profit of small scale enterprises positively. Experienced individuals employed in opportunities to be discovered at lower cost. Performance of small scale enterprises increases by 10.7% for every additional year of experience attained by the individual involve in the business. The performance of small scale enterprise is significantly influenced positively by the number of employees engaged in that business. For every additional employee engaged in small scale enterprise, the revenue increase by 5.6%. Employees serve as input in the production process and the higher the number of employees engaged in small scale business, the more likely it is for the revenue to be impacted positively *ceter is paribus*. The initial capital invested in the business significantly affects performance negatively. The performance of business decreases by 1.3% for every additional capital injection into the business. This result indicates that revenue falls with increase in initial capital injection which is contrary to the a priori expectation. The initial capital injection is necessary as it provides the opportunity for small scale businesses to purchase the basic required inputs to commence the business. However, the negative relationship may be due to unfavourable market which reduces the total revenue. It may also be due to lack of requisite skill in investment due to competing needs of the entrepreneur. Finally, the annual cost incurred by small scale enterprises significantly affects the revenue of businesses positively. For every additional cost of naira incurred in the operation of business will lead to an increase in profit by 2.6%. This finding is inconsistent with the a priori expectation. It is expected that increase in cost as a result of bad managerial decision may impacts negatively on performance. The positive effect of cost on performance may be as a result of excessive spending (processing equipment, firewood, increase volume of fish handled etc) in business that translates into increase in revenue (Table 2)

Constraints of fish marketing performance in Dutsin-ma LGA

The Kendalls' Coefficient of Concordance

The Kendalls Concordance analysis was used to test for the agreement between the ranked constraints of micro-enterprises. If established the degree of agreement and disagreement among M.Sets of n ranks. W is an index that measures the ratio of the observed variance of the sum of ranks to the maximum possible variance of sum of ranks. If the rankings are in perfect agreement, the variability among sums will be a maximum (Mattson, 1986) computing the total score for each constraint and objective, the constraint and objective with the least score is ranked as the most pressing while the one with the highest score is ranked as the least pressing. The total rank score computed is then used to calculate for the coefficient of concordance (w) to measure the degree of agreement in the ranking (1964)

The formula for the coefficient w is then given by:
The formula for the coefficient w is then given by:

$$W = \frac{\sum T2(\sum T)2/n/n}{M^2(A^2 - 1)/12} \quad (2)$$

The formula is further simplified as:

$$W = \frac{12(\sum T^2(\sum T)2/n}{nm^2(n^2 - 1)} \quad (3)$$

where T = Sum of ranks for each factor being ranked
m = number of ranking (marketers)
n = number of factors being ranked

The coefficient of concordance w is tested for significance using the F – distribution.

Constraints of small-scale fish marketing in Dutsin-Ma Local Government Area.

The factors that restraint small-scale fish marketing in Dutsin-Ma LGC according to the survey is presented in table 4.The Kendalls' W' is found to be 0.78 and significant at 1%.The result indicate that there is high level of agreement among the constraints faced by small scale fish traders.The null hypothesis is rejected in favour of the alternate hypothesis .The Kendalls ' W' of 0.78 indicates that there is 78% agreement between the respondents in the ranking of constraints faced by fish marketers.Among the identified constraints poor access to credit facilities, poor market infrastructures,and poor source of water are the top four most constraining factors table---.High interest charged by banks impedes most businesses from borrowing thus are unable to expand.Most banks provide credit facilities to businesses that are able to provide collaterals which is a major challenge to most small scale businesses.lack of proper record keeping habit and improper management of businesses by most small scale enterprises make it more difficult for them to access loan from banks.poor and inadequate market infrastructures such as storage and processing facilities make the marketing of fish products more difficult.High rate of perishability of the fish products,lack of access to useful information,poor environmental condition of the market,incidence of theft and burglary are the next constraining factor.Among the list of constraints high exit and entry rate pose the least threat to fish marketing.This shows that fishing marketing.This shows that fishing activities in the study area is an age long practice the marketing system is organize and efficient.

Conclusion and Recommendation

The performance of small scale fish marketing in Dutsin-ma local government of Katsina state is mostly influenced by the age and the number of years of formal education of the marketer. Younger marketers are more likely to adopt innovations that will translate into higher revenues. Poor source of portable water, poor record keeping, high entry rate of marketers, low access to credit and infrastructural facilities was the most important constraints faced by small scale fish marketers in Dutsin-ma local government area. The situation in aggravated by the collateral requirement coupled with high loan processing fee. It is recommended that policy aim at attracting the youth such as local enterprise and skills development programmes can be put in place. Microfinance and micro-loan centers can be established by the state government in collaboration with the local government and be thoroughly equipped to disburse funds at a lower interest rate to young entrepreneurs irrespective of their political affiliations. Training in improving the techniques of artisanal fishing and processing techniques to give guarantee to the products of the quality required for international market.

References

Agbjebi, F.O. (2010): Salient Issues in Fish Marketing System in Nigeria, Journal of Environmental Issues and Agriculture in Developing Countries Vol. 2(1), Pp. 102

Aworemi, J.R, Abdul-azeez, I.A and Popoola. (2010). Impact of Socio-economic factors on the performance of small scale enterprises in Osun state, Nigeria. International Business Research, Vol. 3, Nol. 2, Pp. 92 – 99.

Biswas, K.P., (1989): Fish, Fisheries and Technology, Vol. 13, Pp. 493 – 496, Narendra Book Delhi India Narendra Publishing House 1417, Kishan Datt Street, Maiwara, Delhi, India

Dauda,A.B.,Yakubu,S.O and Kabir,(2013),Determinants of fish consumption in Dutsin-Ma LGA,Katsina state,Proceedings of the 47th Annual Conference of Agricultural Society of Nigeria,Ibadan 2013.pp 1106

Edward A.L. (1964), Statistical Matures for the Behavoral ScienceWintsan, New York, Pp. 402,410.

Edward M; Kwame: A, Caleb. A, Alexander. N, W. Prince M.E, and Ramatu

M.A. (2013). Performance and Constraints of Small Scale Enterprises in the Accra Metropolitan Area of Ghana. European Journal of Business and Management, Vol. 5(4) Pp. 83 – 90

Enete A.A. and Igbokwe, E.M. (2009). Cassava Market Participation Decision of

Households in Africa. Tropicultural, 27, 3, 129 – 136.

Falodun, O.M. (2011); Analysis of Marketing Channels and Efficiency of marketing system for smoked fish market in Ogun state, Nigeria. An unpublished Bachelor of fisheries management and aquaculture, submitted to the department of Aquaculture Resources Management, University of Agriculture Abeokuta, Ogun State Pp. 2 – 25.

FAO (2003), Report of the Twenty Fifth Session of the Committee on Fisheries, Rome, 24 – 28, February 2003, FAO fisheries Report. No. 702. Rome, FAO 88pp.

FAO (2005), FAO/World fish center workshop on interdisciplinary approaches to the assessment of small scale fisheries, 20 – 22 Sept. 2005 FAO Fisheries Report No. 787. Rome: FAO

Fisher, E.M; Renber, A.R; and Oyke, L.S. (1993), A theoretical overview of the extension of Research on Sex, hinder and Entrepreneurship" Journal of Business Venturing, 8(2), 151 – 168.

Kohls,R.L and Uhl,J.N,(1980):Marketing of Agricultural products 6th Edition Macmillan Publishers Company, pp 575

Muktar, S, (2002), Differences in Male and Female Management Characteristics: A Study of Owner-Manager Businesses", Small Business Economics, 18(4), 289 – 311.

Mattson,D.E,(1986):Statistics difficult concept of understanding Explanations, Bolchanzy Carducci Publishers inc. pp281,283,361,423

Olaoye, O.J. (2010) Dynamics of the adoption process of improved fisheries technologies in Lagos and Ogun state. A Ph.D thesis in the Department of Agriculture and Fisheries Management, University of Agriculture, Abeokuta, Ogun State Nigeria. Pp. 337.

Sindi, J.K. (2008). Kenya's Domestic Hortculture subsector: "What drives commercialization Decisions for Rural Households?" A Published MPhil Thesis for the Award of Master of Science Degree. Department of Agricultural Food, and Resource Economics: Michigan State University, U.S.A.

Tall, A., (2004), "Obstacles to the development of small scale fish trade in West Africa," P. 18, INFOPECHE Abidjan Cofe'D'Noire.

Table 1.Socio-Economic characteristics of the Marketers

Age	**Frequency**	**Percentage**
15 – 24	3	6
25 – 34	10	20
35 – 44	20	40
45 – 54	10	20
55 and above	7	14
TOTAL	**50**	**100**
Educational Status		
Non-formal education	9	18
Arabic Education	18	36
Primary School	8	16
Secondary School	15	30
Tertiary		
Total	**50**	**100**
Household size		
1 – 5	8	16
6 – 10	10	20
11 – 15	22	44
Above	10	20
Total	**50**	**100**
Marketing		
1 – 5	5	10
6 – 10	10	20
11 – 15	28	56
Above	7	14
Total	**50**	**100**
Nature of fish handled		
Smoked fish only	5	10
Dried fish & smoked fish	22	44
Frozen fish	-	-
Fresh fish & dried	15	30
Dried only	8	16
Total	**50**	**100**
Volume of fish handled in kg per week		
1 – 20	28	56

24 – 30	10	20
31 – 40	10	20
Above 40	2	04
Total	**50**	**100**
Approximate distance from home to market (Km)		
1 – 5	23	50
6 – 10	13	26
10 – 15	8	16
Above 15	4	8
Total	**50**	**100**
Source of fish		
Artisanal local fishermen	35	70
Songhai farm	2	4
Zobe dam	13	26
Fish farmers	-	-
Total	**50**	**100**
Average income per week (N)		
Below 10,000	18	36
10,000 – 20,000	20	40
20,000 – 40,000	9	18
Above 40,000	3	6
Total	**50**	**100**
Credit source		
Self	15	30
Borrowed	3	6
Not borrowed	25	50
Inherited funds	7	14
Total	**50**	**100**
Membership of Co-operative society		
None	3	6
1	44	88
2 or more	3	6
Total	**50**	**100**
Marital status		

Single	15	30
Married	35	70
Divorced	-	-
Widow	-	-
Total	**50**	**100**
Primary occupation		
Civil servant	1	2
Fish trading	30	60
Farmer	1	2
Artisanal fishing	18	36
Others	-	-
Total	**50**	**100**
Initial capital		
N1,000 – N10,000	10	20
N10,000 – N20,000	20	40
N20,000 – N30,000	19	18
Above N30,000	11	22
Total	**50**	**100**
Number of employees		
1 – 4	47	94
5 – 9	2	6
10 – 14	-	-
Above 15	-	-
Total	**50**	**100**
Estimated weekly cost		
N1,000 – N5,000	40	80
N6,000 – N10,000	8	16
N11,000 – N15,000	2	4
Above N16,000	-	-
Total	**50**	**100**

Table 2. Estimated result of regression

Variable	Coefficient	Std error	t-value	prob.
Constant	2518.76	1601.10	1.5131	0.0514
Age of respondent	-163.14***	41.76	3.9066	0.000
Gender	148.33	366.13	0.4051	0.6150
Marital status	-616.33**	401.14	1.5364	0.0041
Number of years of Education	117.03***	31.63	3.6999	0.0051
Ownership status	316.21	240.37	1.3155	0.0381
Initial capital invested	-1.31***	0.31	4.2258	0.0022
Annual cost incurred	1.71***	0.06	28.5000	0.003
Membership of Cooperative	2.61**	0.31	8.4193	0.006
Number of observation = 50				
Prob.				(F – statistics)
0.000				128.3100
R-squared				
0.82				
Log				
-1209.110				Likelihood

Source: Regression Estimation from Author's Survey data (2014)***P<0.01,**P<0.05, *p<0.1

Table 3**: Description of the variables used in the regression model**.

Profit (i/c) – used as proxy measurement of retail fish marketing performance.

Explanatory variables

Variables	Description	Measurement	Expected sign
Age	Age of respondent	Number of years	+/-
Gender	Gender of respondent	D = 1 male; 0 = otherwise	+/-
Marital status	Marital status of respondent	D = 1 Married; 0 = otherwise	+/-
Education	Years of formal education	Number of years of education	+
Experience	Number of years of experience	Number of years	+/-
Ownership	Ownership station	D = 1 of owned 0 = otherwise	+/-
Initial capital	Initial seed capital injected	Naira (N)	+
Annual cost	Annual cost incurred	Naira (N)	+/-
Association	Membership of cooperative	D = 1, yes, 0 = no	+

Source: Field Survey, 2014.

Table 4. Constraints of Fish Marketing

Identified constraints	Mean Rank
Poor access to credit facilities	2.0
Poor Market Infrastructures	2.3
Poor record keeping Habit	2.4
Poor Storage Facilities	2.6
Poor water supply condition	3.0
High rate of fish losses	4.8
Lacking access to relevant information	7.0
Bad market Location	9.0
Poor environmental and sanitary condition	11.2
Theft and burglary	13.7
Epileptic power supply	14.2
Poor Security situation	16.3
Low Profit	17.3
Low Demand for fish	20.3
Seasonality of Fish product	21.3
Integrity and Attitudinal problems of marketers	23.1
Lacking Management experience	24.3
Low investment return	24.6
Political Climate	25.1
High rate of entrepreneurial Mortality	26.0
High Exit rate	28.3
High Entry rate	30.0
Number of observation	50
Kendall's 'W'	0.781
Chi-square	1348.61
df	22
Assymp.sig	0.001

Source: Estimation from Authors Survey Data (2014)